August 28, 2015

CCLB C/O Gina Paradis

RE: Appraisal Report

106 Robin Street City of Dunkirk, NY

As requested, I have conducted the investigations and analyses necessary to form an opinion of the market value as of August 19, 2015 of the fee simple interest in the property referenced above.

This is a report which is intended to comply with the reporting requirements set forth under Standards Rule 2-2(a) of the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) for an Appraisal Report. Supporting documentation concerning the data, reasoning, and analysis is retained in the appraiser's file. The depth of discussion contained in this report is specific to the needs of the client and for the intended use as stated in this report. The appraiser is not responsible for unauthorized use of this report.

In my analysis I have used the Limited Appraisal Analysis - Appraisal Report form. I have included an addendum for purposes of location, identification and clarification.

I was not required to report a predetermined value or direction in value that favors the cause of the client or any related party, the amount of the value estimate, the attainment of a specific result, or the occurrence of a subsequent event in order to receive my compensation and/or employment for performing the appraisal. I did not base the appraisal report on a requested minimum valuation, a specific valuation, or the need to approve a specific mortgage loan.

Based on this investigation and the attached analysis, and upon my experience as a real estate appraiser, I have reached the opinion that the subject property as of August 19, 2015 had an "As Is" market value of:

#### **EIGHT THOUSAND DOLLARS**

(\$8,000.00)

The undersigned further certifies that as applicable, and except as specifically noted, this appraisal is subject to the attached Certification and Statement of Limiting Conditions.

Sincerely,

**HOLT ASSOCIATES, INC.** 

Amy Holt, MAI NYS General Appraiser 46-49325

# **Limited Appraisal Analysis - Appraisal Report**

File No.

BORROWER/SUBJECT PROPERTY INFORMATION									
Borrower Chautau	iqua County Land Ban	k	Census	Tract 0356	6.00	Ma	p Reference 79	.14-2-83	
	6 Robin St				Check one:	<b>X</b> SF □		Condo	2-4 Units
City <u>Dunkirk</u>			unty <u>Chautau</u>			State N			.8
Phone No. Res.		n Amount Requested \$		Term	Coroa		ner's Est. of Value		
No. of Rooms		o. of Baths Family roor		oss Living Area		e/Carport type & no.)	Porches, Patio or Pool (specify)	l	entral Air
6	2		No REF	690 Sq.	Ft. No	one	Porch	Y	/es 🔀 No
NEIGHBORHOOD			IELD KEF	OKI					
Location	<b>又</b> Urban	Suburban	Rural	ı	NFIGHBORH	OOD RATING	Good	Avg. F	Fair Poor
Built Up	Over 75%			er 25%	Property Cor			<b>X</b> [	
· —	ılly Dev. Rapid	X Steady	Slow	1		earance of Prop	erties		
Property Values	Increasin	g Stable	Decli	ining	Appeal to Ma	arket		X	
Demand/Supply	Shortage	=		Supply					
Marketing Time	Under 3 I			6 Mos.		, , , , , , ,	0/ 1/	. 0/	
	0 % 1 Family 10 % 2-4	<u> </u>	% Condo	<u>7</u> % Comme	ercial <u>3</u> 9		10% Vacant	27% Othe	<u>:r</u>
Change in Present Land Predominant Occupanc		/ Likely Likely Ta	aking Place Fro % Vacant	UIII		To _			
Similar Housing Price R			dominant Value	\$ 40 000					
Similar Housing Age		s. Predominant Age	60 yr						
	al composition of the neight		to be appraisal	factors.					
Comments including the	ose factors affecting market	ability (e.g. public parks, scl	hools, view, nois	se) <u>The si</u>	ubject is lo	cated in the	City of Dunkirl	k. It is clo	ose to
schools, shopping	, educational facilities	and employment.							
SUBJECT PROPERTY									
Approximate Year Built	1900 No. of Unit	s 1 No. of St	ories 1.5	5	PROPERTY I	RATING	Good	Avg F	Fair Poor
1 ''	, semi-detached, etc.) De			<u> </u>	Condition of				
Design (rambler, split, e	etc.) Old Style				Compatibility	to Neighborhoo	od 🗌	<b>X</b> [ <b>X X X X X X X X X X</b>	
Exterior Walls Material	Vinyl		alt Shingle		Appeal and I	Marketability		X	
	n a FEMA Special Flood Haz	ard Area? 🔀 No 📙	Yes						
Special Energy Efficient	Items <u>None</u>								
Comments (favorable o	r unfavorable including any (	deferred maintenance)	The subject	is in averac	ne- conditio	n The roof	is as the end	of its eco	nomic life
`	s up to a commecial pa	, .			•				
commercial zoning									
		SALES CO	MPARISO	ON ANAL	YSIS				
ITEM	SUBJECT	COMPARABLE N		1	OMPARABLE N	0. 2		PARABLE NO	). 3
Address Dunkirk N	St	621 Main St		382 Lake \$			160 St. Marg		
Dulikirk, in t	′ 14048 T	Dunkirk, NY 14048		Dunkirk, N			Dunkirk, NY	14048	
Proximity to Subject Days on Market		0.84 miles SE 211		1.02 miles 11	<u> </u>		1.40 miles E 62		
Sales Price	\$	\$	18,000		\$	9,200		\$	20,000
Sales Price/Sq. Ft.	\$ /Sq. Ft.				3.39 /Sq. Ft.	3,200		5 /Sq. Ft.	20,000
Data/Verif. Source(s)		MLS 1034877		MLS 1033			MLS 103637		
VALUE ADJUSTMENTS	DESCRIPTION	DESCRIPTION	+(-)\$ Adjust.	DESCR	RIPTION	+(-)\$ Adjust.	DESCRIPT	ON	+(-)\$ Adjust.
Date of Sale/Time		12/31/2014		11/18/2013	3		2/27/2015		0
Location	Average-	Superior		Superior			Superior	<u> </u>	-4,000
Site Size Site View	2,030 sf	6,534 sf	1	1.5 ac		1	8,000 sf		0
Age	Res/Comm 115	Res 115		Res 103			Res 103		0 0
Condition	Fair	Average	-3,600				Average		-4,000
Above Grade	Total Bdrms Baths	Total Bdrms Baths	. 0,000	Total Bdrm	ns Baths		Total Bdrms	Baths	1,000
Room Count	6 2 1.1	6 2 1	+1,000	6 2	1	+1,000	7 2	1	+1,000
Gross Living Area	690 Sq. Ft.	900 Sq. Ft.	-1,100	1	,097 Sq. Ft.	-2,000	1,27	70 Sq. Ft.	-2,900
Heating/Cooling	Gas FA	Gas FA	:	Gas FA			Gas FA		0
Garage/Carport	None	None		None			2 car det	- 1	-2,000
Porches, Patio, Pools, etc.	Porch	Porch	U	Porch		U	Porch Deck		0
Special Energy			1			 			
Efficient Items			1 1 1	L		1 1 1			
Other Feature			1			1			
Other Feature					_				
Net Adj. (total)		+ 🗙 - \$	-7,300		- \$	-1,000			-11,900
Indicated Value		Net: 40.6 %	40 700		0.9%	0.000	Net: 59.55		0.400
of Subject General Comments	The adjusted sales ra	Gross: 51.7% \$	10,700		2.6% \$	8,200			8,100
	end of the range was		<u>,, 100 tO \$10,</u>	roo wiiii a	mean of \$5	,,000. Due	io ine condide	ıı oı ule l	ооі, а
	are range was								
Property Rights Apprais	sed 🔀 Fee Simple 🗌	Leased Fee Leaseho	old Other	(describe)					
	//	Opinion of M	arket Valu	e \$	8,0	00	as of	8/19/2	2015
	Comer Hol	+							
Signature						ature <u>08/28/</u>			
	/ Holt, MAI				r Designation		eral Appraiser	40/00:=	
License or Certification Inspection of Subject:		rior & Exterior Exte		License or Cer Date of Inspec		e <u>NY</u>	Expires <u>01/</u>	19/201/	
וויסטטטנוטוו טו טעטןלטל.	INUITE   IIIU	ויטו עג באנטווטו   באול	יטווע וטווע '	שמנה הו וווסחבר	AUUII.				

### **Subject Photo Page**

Borrower	Chautauqua County Land Bank				
Property Address	106 Robin St				
City	Dunkirk	County Chautauqua	State NY	Zip Code 14048	
Lender/Client					



### **Subject Front**

106 Robin St Sales Price

Gross Living Area 690 Total Rooms 6 Total Bedrooms 2 Total Bathrooms 1.1 Location Average-View Res/Comm Site 2,030 sf

Quality

115 Age



## **Subject Rear**



Roof

## **Subject Photo Page**

Borrower	Chautauqua County Land Bank				
Property Address	106 Robin St				
City	Dunkirk	County Chautauqua	State NY	Zip Code 14048	
Landar/Cliant					



### Kitchen

106 Robin St Sales Price 690 Gross Living Area Total Rooms 6 Total Bedrooms 2 Total Bathrooms 1.1 Location Average-View Res/Comm Site 2,030 sf Quality

Age 115



#### **Bath**



### Living

### **Comparable Photo Page**

Borrower	Chautauqua County Land Bank				
Property Address	106 Robin St				
City	Dunkirk	County Chautauqua	State NY	Zip Code 14048	
Lender/Client					



### Comparable 1

621 Main St

Prox. to Subject 0.84 miles SE Sales Price 18,000 Gross Living Area 900 Total Rooms 6 Total Bedrooms 2 **Total Bathrooms** 1 Location Superior View Res 6,534 sf Site Quality 115 Age



### Comparable 2

382 Lake Shore Dr

1.02 miles E Prox. to Subject Sales Price 9,200 Gross Living Area 1,097 Total Rooms 6 **Total Bedrooms** 2 Total Bathrooms 1 Location Superior View Res Site 1.5 ac Quality 103 Age



#### Comparable 3

160 St. Margay St

Prox. to Subject 1.40 miles E Sales Price 20,000 1,270 Gross Living Area Total Rooms Total Bedrooms 2 Total Bathrooms 1 Location Superior View Res 8,000 sf Site

Quality

Age 103

orrower	Chautauqua County Land Bank			File No	<u>.                                    </u>
roperty Address	106 Robin St	County	L		
ity ender/Client	Dunkirk	County C	hautauqua	State NY	Zip Code 14048
APPRAIS	AL AND REPORT IDENTIFI	CATION			
This Report	is <u>one</u> of the following types:				
<b>X</b> Appraisa	Il Report (A written report prepared under	Standards Rule	2-2(a) , pursuant to the Sc	cope of Work, as disclosed	elsewhere in this report.)
Restricte Appraisa				cope of Work, as disclosed	d elsewhere in this report,
Commen	ts on Standards Rule 2-3	3			
- The statements - The reported ar analyses, opinior - Unless otherwis - Unless otherwis period immediate - I have no bias v - My engagemen - My compensati client, the amoun - My analyses, o were in effect at - Unless otherwis - Unless otherwis	ne best of my knowledge and belief: s of fact contained in this report are true and correspondinglyses, opinions, and conclusions are limited only as, and conclusions. se indicated, I have no present or prospective interse indicated, I have performed no services, as an ably preceding acceptance of this assignment. with respect to the property that is the subject of the tin this assignment was not contingent upon develon for completing this assignment is not contingent of the value opinion, the attainment of a stipulated pinions, and conclusions were developed, and this the time this report was prepared. se indicated, I have made a personal inspection of se indicated, no one provided significant real property appraisal assistance is	rest in the property that appraiser or in any oth this report or the partie eloping or reporting property the development upon the development or the partie is report has been preperty that is the property that is the property appraisal assistan	at is the subject of this report a her capacity, regarding the pro- es involved with this assignme redetermined results. ent or reporting of a predeterm- ence of a subsequent event dir hared, in conformity with the U he subject of this report. ce to the person(s) signing th	and no personal interest with operty that is the subject of this ent.  nined value or direction in value rectly related to the intended understanding Standards of Profession	respect to the parties involved. s report within the three-year  ue that favors the cause of the se of this appraisal. onal Appraisal Practice that
	ts on Appraisal and Repo			nents:	
APPRAISER	-		SUPERVISORY of	r CO-APPRAISER (if	applicable):
	Comy Holt				
Signature:Name: Amy H	Concer 1		Signature: Name:		
State Certification			State Certification #:		
	Expiration Date of Certification or License: 01/19	9/2017		ion Date of Certification or Lic	ense:
Effective Date of	and Report: <u>08/28/2015</u> Appraisal: <u>8/19/2015</u>		Date of Signature:		
Inspection of Sub	oject: None X Interior and Exterior   n (if applicable):	Exterior-Only	Inspection of Subject:	None Interior and	d Exterior Exterior-Only

**DEFINITION OF MARKET VALUE:** The most probable price which a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all conditions requisite to a fair sale, the buyer and seller, each acting prudently, knowledgeably and assuming the price is not affected by undue stimulus. Implicit in this definition is the consummation of a sale as of a specified date and the passing of title from seller to buyer under conditions whereby: (1) buyer and seller are typically motivated; (2) both parties are well informed or well advised, and each acting in what he considers his own best interest; (3) a reasonable time is allowed for exposure in the open market; (4) payment is made in terms of cash in U.S. dollars or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and (5) the price represents the normal consideration for the property sold unaffected by special or creative financing or sales concessions\* granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Source: FDIC Interagency Appraisal and Evaluation Guidelines, October 27, 1994.)

\*Adjustments to the comparables must be made for special or creative financing or sales concessions. No adjustments are necessary for those costs which are normally paid by sellers as a result of tradition or law in a market area; these costs are readily identifiable since the seller pays these costs in virtually all sales transactions. Special or creative financing adjustments can be made to the comparable property by comparisons to financing terms offered by a third party institutional lender that is not already involved in the property or transaction. Any adjustment should not be calculated on a mechanical dollar for dollar cost of the financing or concession but the dollar amount of any adjustment should approximate the market's reaction to the financing or concessions based on the appraiser's judgement.

#### STATEMENT OF LIMITING CONDITIONS AND CERTIFICATION

CONTINGENT AND LIMITING CONDITIONS: The appraiser's certification that appears in the appraisal report is subject to the following conditions:

- 1. The appraiser will not be responsible for matters of a legal nature that affect either the property being appraised or the title to it. The appraiser assumes that the title is good and marketable and, therefore, will not render any opinions about the title. The property is valued on the basis of it being under responsible ownership.
- 2. Any sketch provided in the appraisal report may show approximate dimensions of the improvements and is included only to assist the reader of the report in visualizing the property. The appraiser has made no survey of the property.
- 3. The appraiser will not give testimony or appear in court because he or she made an appraisal of the property in question, unless specific arrangements to do so have been made beforehand, or as otherwise required by law.
- 4. Any distribution of valuation between land and improvements in the report applies only under the existing program of utilization. These separate valuations of the land and improvements must not be used in conjunction with any other appraisal and are invalid if they are so used.
- 5. The appraiser has no knowledge of any hidden or unapparent conditions of the property or adverse environmental conditions (including the presence of hazardous waste, toxic substances, etc.) that would make the property more or less valuable, and has assumed that there are no such conditions and makes no guarantees or warranties, express or implied, regarding the condition of the property. The appraiser will not be responsible for any such conditions that do exist or for any engineering or testing that might be required to discover whether such conditions exist. This appraisal report must not be considered an environmental assessment of the subject property.
- 6. The appraiser obtained the information, estimates, and opinions that were expressed in the appraisal report from sources that he or she considers to be reliable and believes them to be true and correct. The appraiser does not assume responsibility for the accuracy of such items that were furnished by other parties.
- 7. The appraiser will not disclose the contents of the appraisal report except as provided for in the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice, and any applicable federal, state or local laws.
- 8. The appraiser has based his or her appraisal report and valuation conclusion for an appraisal that is subject to satisfactory completion, repairs, or alterations on the assumption that completion of the improvements will be performed in a workmanlike manner.
- 9. The appraiser must provide his or her prior written consent before the lender/client specified in the appraisal report can distribute the appraisal report (including conclusions about the property value, the appraiser's identity and professional designations, and references to any professional appraisal organizations or the firm with which the appraiser is associated) to anyone other than the borrower; the mortgagee or its successors and assigns; the mortgage insurer; consultants; professional appraisal organizations; any state or federally approved financial institution; or any department, agency, or instrumentality of the United States or any state or the District of Columbia; except that the lender/client may distribute the property description section of the report only to data collection or reporting service(s) without having to obtain the appraiser's prior written consent. The appraiser's written consent and approval must also be obtained before the appraisal can be conveyed by anyone to the public through advertising, public relations, news, sales, or other media.
- 10. The appraiser is not an employee of the company or individual(s) ordering this report and compensation is not contingent upon the reporting of a predetermined value or direction of value or upon an action or event resulting from the analysis, opinions, conclusions, or the use of this report. This assignment is not based on a required minimum, specific valuation, or the approval of a loan.

File No.

**CERTIFICATION:** The appraiser certifies and agrees that:

1. The statements of fact contained in this report are true and correct.

2. The reported analyses, opinions, and conclusions are limited only by the reported assumptions and limiting conditions and are my personal, impartial and unbiased professional analyses, opinions, and conclusions.

3. Unless otherwise indicated, I have no present or prospective interest in the property that is the subject of this report and no personal interest interest with respect to the parties involved.

4. Unless otherwise indicated, I have performed no services, as an appraiser or in any other capacity, regarding the property that is the subject of this report within the three-year period immediately preceding acceptance of this assignment.

5. I have no bias with respect to the property that is the subject of this report or the parties involved with this assignment.

6. My engagement in this assignment was not contingent upon developing or reporting predetermined results.

7. My compensation for completing this assignment is not contingent upon the development or reporting of a predetermined value or direction in value that favors the cause of the client, the amount of the value opinion, the attainment of a stipulated result, or the occurrence of a subsequent event directly related to the intended use of this appraisal.

8. My analyses, opinions, and conclusions were developed, and this report has been prepared, in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice that were in effect at the time this report was prepared.

9. Unless otherwise indicated, I have made a personal inspection of the interior and exterior areas of the property that is the subject of this report, and the exteriors of all properties listed as comparables.

10. Unless otherwise indicated, no one provided significant real property appraisal assistance to the person(s) signing this certification (if there are exceptions, the name of each individual providing significant real property appraisal assistance is stated elsewhere in this report).

#### ADDRESS OF PROPERTY ANALYZED: 106 Robin St, Dunkirk, NY 14048

APPRAISER:	SUPERVISORY or CO-APPRAISER (if applicable):
Signature: Connect Food	Signature:
Name: Amy Holt, MAI	Name:
Title:	Title:
State Certification #:	State Certification #:
or State License #: 46-49325	or State License #:
State: NY Expiration Date of Certification or License: 01/19/2017	State: Expiration Date of Certification or License:
Date Signed: 08/28/2015	Date Signed:
	☐ Did ☐ Did Not Inspect Property

### **Location Map**

Borrower	Chautauqua County Land Bank				
Property Address	106 Robin St				
City	Dunkirk	County Chautauqua	State NY	Zip Code 14048	
Lender/Client					

